

## **Exhibit "19"**

1 here. There were no account -- Grande was not terminating  
2 subscribers prior to 2017. It began in 2017.

3 That's all I have, your Honor.

4 THE COURT: Thank you.

5 I'm prepared to rule on this from the bench and  
6 so, I'll state my ruling on the record and I'll follow up  
7 with a written order memorializing it.

8 But after reviewing -- you know, hearing the  
9 argument, reviewing the record -- I mean, sorry, the  
10 motion and the response and the reply and then, I'm  
11 hearing argument on the hearing here today, I'm reviewing  
12 the requests themselves, and really, what this motion's  
13 directed at is three specific RFPs that were attached as  
14 -- or on the docket as 68-2, RFPs No. 3, 4 and 5. In my  
15 view, these are just untethered to any suggested relevant  
16 timeframe in that I -- ultimately, I agree with defendants  
17 that they're too broad. Given plaintiffs' counsel an  
18 opportunity to suggest a cutoff or a relevant timeframe  
19 and the RFPs themselves just basically adopt the universe  
20 of documents from the UMG case, that's a different case,  
21 different facts. I agree with defendants about that.

22 And so, therefore, I'm denying the motion to  
23 compel. If -- I don't necessarily -- you know, in denying  
24 that motion to compel, I don't disagree that there might  
25 be some realm of documents that are discoverable beyond

1 the suggested timeline of defendants, but I agree that as  
2 these are worded, it's too broad and goes far too far and  
3 that a more targeted discovery request either identifying  
4 a timeline that has some basis in the facts alleged in  
5 this case or particular subscribers, if there are  
6 particular subscribers who are alleged to have infringed,  
7 those sort of targeted discovery requests I think would be  
8 appropriate. But without any sort of bracketing of the  
9 requests as they appear here, I'm not going to grant that  
10 motion nor am I going to rewrite it for plaintiff.

11 So I'm denying the motion. As I said, I'll issue  
12 a written order to that effect. And if there's not  
13 anything else for us to address while we're all here  
14 together, Mr. Culpepper.

15 MR. CULPEPPER: I have nothing further, your  
16 Honor.

17 MR. HOWENSTINE: No, your Honor.

18 THE COURT: All right. Then you are excused.  
19 Safe travels home.

20 MR. HOWENSTINE: Thank you.

21 (Proceedings conclude at 2:23 p.m.)

22

23

24

25

1  
2  
3 REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE  
45 I, LILY I. REZNIK, DO HEREBY CERTIFY THAT THE FOREGOING  
6 WAS TRANSCRIBED FROM AN ELECTRONIC RECORDING MADE AT THE  
7 TIME OF THE AFORESAID PROCEEDINGS AND IS A CORRECT  
8 TRANSCRIPT, TO THE BEST OF MY ABILITY, MADE FROM THE  
9 PROCEEDINGS IN THE ABOVE-ENTITLED MATTER, AND THAT THE  
10 TRANSCRIPT FEES AND FORMAT COMPLY WITH THOSE PRESCRIBED BY  
11 THE COURT AND JUDICIAL CONFERENCE OF THE UNITED STATES,  
12 ON THIS 24th DAY OF APRIL, 2023.

13

14

15 *Lily Iva Reznik*16 ~~~~~  
17 *LILY I. REZNIK CRR RMR*  
18 *Official Court Reporter*  
19 *United States District Court*  
20 *Austin Division*  
21 *501 West 5th Street, Suite 4153*  
22 *Austin, Texas 78701*  
23 *(512) 391-8792*  
24 *SOT Certification No. 4481*  
25 *Expires: 1-31-25*